

Janel Hau

From: brownlees@xtra.co.nz
Sent: Friday, 21 March 2014 2:34 p.m.
To: Mailroom Mailbox
Subject: TRIM: Submission on Canterbury LWRP
Attachments: SW Plan Submission.docx; Submission on Proposed Variation to Canterbury LWRP.jpg

Categories: Purple Category
HP TRIM Record Number: C14C/43758

Please find attached a submission lodged on the Proposed Variation to the Canterbury Land and Water Regional Plan.

W and H Brownlee
The Crossing Ltd
172 Te Pirita Road
RD 13
Rakaia

Sent from Windows Mail



Submission on Proposed Variation 1 to the Proposed Canterbury Land and Water Regional Plan

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

Submitter ID:

File No:

Form 5: Submissions on a Publicly Notified Proposed Policy Statement or Regional Plan under Clause 6 of Schedule 1 of the Resource Management Act 1991

Return your signed submission by 5.00pm Friday 21 March 2014 to:

Freepost 1201 Variation 1 to pLWRP
Environment Canterbury
P O Box 345
Christchurch 8140

Full Name: William David George and Henrietta Lucy Brownlee Phone (Hm): 03 3180 700
 Organisation*: The Crossing Ltd Phone (Wk): 033180700
* the organisation that this submission is made on behalf of
 Postal Address: 172 Te Pirita Road Phone (Cell): 0274 570380
13RD Rakaia Postcode: 7783
 Email: brownlees@extra.co.nz Fax: 03 3180 704
 Contact name and postal address for service of person making submission (if different from above):
Bill and Henrietta Brownlee

Trade Competition

Pursuant to Schedule 1 of the Resource Management Act 1991, a person who could gain an advantage in trade competition through the submission may make a submission only if directly affected by an effect of the proposed policy statement or plan that:

- a) adversely affects the environment; and
- b) does not relate to trade competition or the effects of trade competition.

Please tick the sentence that applies to you:

- I could not gain an advantage in trade competition through this submission; or
- I could gain an advantage in trade competition through this submission.

If you have ticked this box please select one of the following:

- I am directly affected by an effect of the subject matter of the submission
- I am not directly affected by an effect of the subject matter of the submission

Signature: H Brownlee Date: 21-3-14

(Signature of person making submission or person authorised to sign on behalf of person making the submission)

Please note:

(1) all information contained in a submission under the Resource Management Act 1991, including names and addresses for service, becomes public information.

I do not wish to be heard in support of my submission; or

I do wish to be heard in support of my submission; and if so,

I would be prepared to consider presenting your submission in a joint case with others making a similar submission at any hearing

Section 11.1A Definitions

The definition of the Selwyn Waihora catchment refers to the planning maps. The planning maps show that the Selwyn Waihora catchment covers the area from the Rakaia River to the Waimakariri River. The Selwyn Waihora catchment is a lesser area than that shown on the planning maps. Land adjacent to the Rakaia River will not influence the quality of water in the Selwyn Waihora catchment. This is recognised by excluding the area on the lower Rakaia terrace from the catchment. The area excluded is considered to be arbitrary and does not reflect the area that of land that can be farmed at good practice or better without affecting the quality of water in the Selwyn Waihora catchment.

Section 11.4 Policies

Support Policies 11.4.1 – 11.4.4 to manage water and discharges to improve water quality within the Selwyn Waihora catchment.

Policy 11.4.12 relates to the “catchment” rather than the Selwyn Waihora catchment. There is no definition for “catchment”. Regardless, this policy is supported.

Policy 11.4.13 also relates to the “catchment” and is supported.

Policy 11.4.14 does not refer any particular area and introduces reductions in discharges that go beyond good practice. These reductions come at a cost to farming businesses. These costs may result in benefits within the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment, because nutrient losses into Te Waihora will be reduced. However, within the areas outside of the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment these reductions will incur significant cost and may not result in any benefits. The case for requiring reduced nutrient losses beyond good management practice for properties outside of the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment has not been made.

The outcome sought is to include an additional orange zone area to replace the red zone area between the Green zone boundary and the Selwyn Waihora hydrological boundary.

Policy 11.4.17 provides for Central Plains Water shareholders to manage a nutrient load that allows land use change. Other irrigation schemes provide alpine river water into the zone, but are located outside of the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment. The Early's irrigation scheme (alternatively known as the Glenroy scheme) located at Te Pirita provides water to land adjacent to the Rakaia River. This Policy should be expanded to provide for collective management by smaller established irrigation schemes so that the scheme areas can be expanded and scheme members can change land use, where the land is not within the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment. Provided the land is irrigated is outside of the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment, the reductions required under Policy 11.4.14(b) should not apply but good management practice will apply.

The outcome sought is to recognise other irrigation schemes and provide those operating within the zone but outside of the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment flexibility to manage their nutrient load and land use change.

Policy 11.4.22 discourages the transfer of water. Greater use of alpine surface water for irrigation, particularly where it is replacing deep groundwater, is considered to be consistent with other Policies.

The outcome sought is that Policy 11.4.22 (c) should not apply to surface water transfers.

Policy 11.4.26 provides a lower reliability of supply to shareholders of irrigation schemes. The Early's irrigation scheme is currently an informal group, but is likely to become a formal entity. This Policy will discourage the forming of a company because reliability of supply will be lowered. The Rakaia River is a large alpine River with high flows during hot dry years. Limiting reliability of supply comes at an economic cost, with little or no benefit to the Rakaia River, because the minimum flow mitigates the adverse effects of abstractions.

The outcome sought is that the 9/10 year reliability provided by the LWRP should apply to alpine river takes.

Section 11.5 Rules

Rules 11.5.6-13 currently apply to the Selwyn Waihora catchment. Regulation of land use through appropriate rules is supported.

Rule 11.5.9 requires reduction in nutrient losses that will result in a reduction in agricultural production and profitability. The loss in production is a cost that far exceeds any benefit in areas that are not within the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment. Any mitigation in areas outside of the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment will not reduce nutrient loss in the Te Waihora. The "green" zone adjacent to the Rakaia River can justifiably be enlarged and the extent of the Selwyn Waihora catchment shown in the planning maps reduced.

The outcome sought is to correctly identify the catchment that influences water quality in Te Waihora in the planning maps and providing a rule that extends the green zone to the Rakaia Terrace Road upstream of State Highway One, and an Orange zone between the Rakaia Terrace Rd and the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment boundary.

Rule 11.5.14 justifiably supports management of land and water within the framework of an irrigation scheme. However, by narrowing the definition of an irrigation scheme to Central Plains Water the plan fails to provide opportunities for smaller existing irrigation schemes to improve nutrient management practices and create nutrient and water allocation headroom for future growth.

This rule should also provide for existing irrigation schemes outside of the Selwyn Waihora Hydrological catchment to aggregate the permitted nutrient loss of members and manage nutrients collectively among members.

Section 6 Map Series

The LWRP identified green, orange and red zones at a high level region wide scale. The expectation was that the zones would be considered locally and revised when the zone plan was introduced. The maps do not change the green Rakaia Riparian zone boundary with the northern red zone.

The planning maps show that the lower terrace of the Rakaia River is not included within the SW catchment. This appears to be the result of applying the Rakaia River Riparian Sub-Zone boundary, which is described in detail in ECan Technical Report R09/43. The

It is considered that this historic boundary is not appropriate for managing land use. If land does not affect the quality of water in Te Waihora, then it should not be subject to such drastic reductions in nutrient loss, but should meet good practice nutrient losses.

The maps should be changed to identify an orange zone that is between the current green zone and the Selwyn Waihora hydrological catchment boundary.